

Report of the Meeting

**National Advisory Committee on Institutional Quality and Integrity
(NACIQI)**

February 22-24, 2017



_____/s/_____
Arthur E. Keiser, Ph.D., Chair

TABLE OF CONTENTS

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY.....	4
ELECTION OF A NEW CHAIR AND VICE CHAIR.....	6
PANEL ON OUTCOME MEASURES.....	6
SUMMARY OF AGENCY-RELATED ACTIONS.....	6
NATIONAL COORDINATING CENTER ACCREDITATION WORKGROUP.....	10
NACIQI POLICY DISCUSSION.....	10

DISCLAIMER

This report summarizes the deliberations of the National Advisory Committee on Institutional Quality and Integrity (NACIQI) at its February 22-24, 2017 meeting. The NACIQI is an advisory committee established by the Higher Education Opportunity Act of 2008, and is subject to the Federal Advisory Committee Act. This report represents the views of the NACIQI. The report has not been reviewed for approval by the Department of Education, and therefore, the report's recommendations do not purport to represent the views of the Department.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

NACIQI was most recently authorized by Section 106 of the Higher Education Opportunity Act of 2008. NACIQI's primary functions include advising the Secretary of Education on the establishment and enforcement of criteria for recognition of accrediting agencies under Subpart 2 of Part H, Title IV, of the Higher Education Act of 1965, as amended (HEA), as well as the recognition of specific accrediting agencies or associations or a specific State approval agency. The NACIQI also advises the Secretary on the eligibility and certification process for institutions of higher education under Title IV, of the HEA, including the relationship between accreditation of institutions of higher education and the certification and eligibility of such institutions, and state licensing responsibilities with respect to such institutions.

NACIQI met to carry out its responsibilities to advise the senior Department official with respect to the recognition of accrediting agencies at its February 22-24, 2017 meeting at the Hilton Alexandria Old Town Hotel at 176 King Street, Alexandria, VA 22314.

NACIQI reviewed the following types of applications at its February 22-24, 2017 meeting:

- One application for renewal of recognition of a state agency for the approval of nurse education;
- One request for an expansion of scope;
- Four applications for renewal of recognition from accrediting agencies; and
- One compliance report from an accrediting agency.

Except for a recommendation regarding one accrediting agency, the Accrediting Bureau of Health Education Schools, NACIQI's recommendations concur with the staff recommendations. NACIQI reviews all information submitted by an agency in support of its petition, the staff analysis and report, and third-party comments. NACIQI continued its [pilot project](#) and considered data provided by the [accreditor data dashboards](#) as part of its review process.

NACIQI elected Arthur E. Keiser as Chairman and Frank H. Wu as Vice Chairman.

NACIQI heard a panel presentation from representatives of accrediting agencies and associations regarding how the agencies they represent consider outcome measures as part of their review of institutions. Panel members included: Barbara Brittingham, Chair, The Council of Regional Accrediting Commissions (C-RAC); Laura Rasar King, Chair, Association of Specialized and Professional Accreditors; and Michale S. McComis, Executive Director, Accrediting Commission of Career Schools and Colleges (ACCSC). Panel members also updated NACIQI on relevant initiatives, such as C-RAC's initiative to review low graduation rates of its institutions.

Meg Grigal, Co-Director of Think College, and Stephanie Smith Lee, Chair of the National Coordinating Center Accreditation Workgroup, presented its report on model accreditation standards for higher education programs for students with intellectual disability. Chairman Keiser appointed Member Derlin to represent NACIQI on the Accreditation Workgroup going forward.

NACIQI engaged in a policy discussion and moved to implement questions in the pilot project as a standard on-going practice of the Committee's review of accrediting agencies. NACIQI also had consensus to continue use of the accreditor dashboards in its review of accrediting agencies, and to identify new opportunities or measures to incorporate into the dashboards. Oliver Schak from the Office of Planning, Evaluation, and Policy Development, presented the update of the accreditation dashboards to NACIQI. NACIQI moved to send a formal invitation to the Secretary of Education for its next NACIQI meeting.

NACIQI members in attendance for all or part of the meeting included Arthur Keiser (Chair), Frank Wu (Vice Chair), Kathleen Sullivan Alioto, Simon Boehme, Jill Derby, Roberta Derlin, George T. French, Brian Jones, Paul LeBlanc, Anne Neal, Richard O'Donnell, Susan Phillips, Claude Pressnell, Arthur Rothkopf, Steven VanAusdle, Ralph Wolff, and Federico Zaragoza. U.S. Department of Education representatives who participated in the meeting included: NACIQI Executive Director and Designated Federal Official Jennifer Hong, Accreditation Director Herman Bounds, Sally Morgan and Donna Mangold (Office of the General Counsel), Elizabeth Daggett, Nicole Harris, Valerie Lefor, Stephanie McKissic, Charles Mula, Steve Porcelli, and Rachael Shultz.

ELECTION OF NEW CHAIRPERSON AND VICE CHAIRPERSON

NACIQI elected Arthur E. Keiser as Chairman and Frank H. Wu as Vice Chairman. No other nominations for these offices were put forward; elections to both offices were by acclamation.

PANEL ON OUTCOME MEASURES

NACIQI heard a panel presentation from representatives of accrediting agencies and associations regarding how the agencies they represent consider outcome measures as part of their review of institutions. Panel members included: Barbara Brittingham, Chair, The Council of Regional Accrediting Commissions (C-RAC); Laura Rasar King, Chair, Association of Specialized and Professional Accreditors; and Michale S. McComis, Executive Director, Accrediting Commission of Career Schools and Colleges (ACCSC). Panel members also updated NACIQI on relevant initiatives, such as C-RAC's initiative to review low graduation rates of its institutions.

Presentation materials are accessible on the [NACIQI website](#) under "February 22-24, 2017 Meeting." NACIQI members lauded the presentations as helpful to informing their work and encouraged such sessions for future meetings.

SUMMARY OF AGENCY-RELATED ACTIONS

The following agency was acted on as a consent agenda with the following recommendation:

Recommendation: Vote 15-0

Move that the NACIQI recommend that the senior Department official accept the recommendations as stated on the consent agenda for those agencies listed.

Missouri State Board of Nursing

Action for Consideration: Renewal of Recognition of State Agency for the Approval of Nurse Education

Recommendation: Renew the agency's recognition for a period of four years.

NACIQI Primary Readers: Kathleen Sullivan Alioto, George French

The following agencies were acted on using NACIQI's standard review procedures. For renewal of recognition applications, the review also included pilot project questions:

Accrediting Bureau of Health Education Schools (ABHES)

Action for Consideration: Expansion of scope

Recommendation: Vote 8 - 1

Deny the agency's request for an expansion of scope.

Discussion: NACIQI determined that the agency had not demonstrated sufficient capacity in order to review Masters-level degree programs, and further expressed concerns regarding faculty credentialing.

NACIQI Primary Readers:

Steven VanAusdle

Frank H. Wu

Representatives of the Agency:

Florence Tate | Executive Director, ABHES

Joyce Laing | Director of Programs, ABHES

Elise Scanlon | Attorney

Western Association for Schools and Colleges, Accrediting Commission for Community and Junior Colleges (ACCJC)

Action for Consideration: Compliance report

Recommendation: Vote 9 – 2 (Recusals: Alioto, Wolff, Wu)

Renew the agency's recognition for a period of 1.5 years and lift the scope limitation imposed in the April 5, 2016 decision letter related to baccalaureate degrees.

Discussion: NACIQI concurred with the staff recommendation.

NACIQI Primary Readers:

Roberta L. Derlin

Arthur E. Keiser

Representative of the Agency:

Richard A. Winn, Ed.D. | Interim President, ACCJC

Stephanie Droker, Ed.D. | Vice President for Policy and Research, ACCJC

Norv Wellsfry, Ed.D. | Vice President, ACCJC

Raul Rodriguez, Ph.D. | ACCJC Chair

Steve Winnick, J.D. | Attorney, Education Counsel LLC

Third Party Commenters:

1. Jonathan Lightman, Executive Director, Faculty Association of California Community Colleges
2. Martin Hittelman, Mathematics Professor Emeritus, Los Angeles Valley College, Retired Professor of Mathematics, Los Angeles Valley College
3. Dr. Mike Solow, Chemistry Department Chairperson, City College of San Francisco
4. Alisa Messer, English faculty, City College of San Francisco, American Federation of Teachers
5. Timothy Killikelly, Political Science faculty, City College of San Francisco, American Federation of Teachers
6. Wendy Kaufmyn, Engineering faculty, City College of San Francisco, CCSF, AFT Local 2121
7. Muriel L. Parenteau, Department Chair – Disabled Students Programs and Services, City College of San Francisco
8. Everardo Gonzalez, CCSF Student, Save CCSF Coalition
9. Molly Chlebnikow, PhD Candidate, University of Hawai'i Manoa
10. Kim Lee, Retired Teacher, City College of San Francisco
11. Vivek Narayan, Student at CCSF, CCSF student, Solidarity Committee
12. Jas Murray, Student at CCSF, childcare professional, CCSF student, Queer Resource Center, Child Development Studies, Film Studies
13. Ann Killebrew, BSN, MS, PHN CFT Retiree, Council VP North AFT 2121, Retiree Chapter Chair City College of San Francisco Faculty Union

14. Karen Saginor, Librarian, City College of San Francisco
 15. Miriam Goldstein, Legislative Director, Congresswoman Jackie Speier (CA-14)
 16. Julie Bruno, President, Academic Senate for California Community Colleges
 17. John Stankas, Vice President, Academic Senate for California Community Colleges
 18. Jeffery M Freitas, Secretary Treasurer, California Federation of Teachers
 19. Shannon Lienhart, Mathematics Faculty, Palomar Community College, American Federation of Teachers, Local AFT 6161; San Diego & Imperial County Labor Council; AFL - CIO; California Federation of Teachers; American Federation of Teachers
 20. Alma Nuno Ramos, Student at CCSF, CCSF student, Solidarity Committee, Behavioral & Social Sciences Department
 21. Ed Jaramillo, Peralta Federation of Teachers, Local 1603
 22. Monica Malamud, Professor of Spanish, President, Cañada College (San Mateo County Community College District), San Mateo Community College Federation of Teachers, AFT 1493
 23. Tema L. Staig, Faculty, Theatre Academy, LA College Faculty Guild, Local AFT 1521
 24. Congressman Alan Lowenthal, CA-47
 25. Win-Mon Kyi, Student of City College of San Francisco, organizer of CCSF solidarity committee, CCSF Solidarity Committee
 26. Bruce Boyden, Superintendent of Instruction, St. Timothy's Episcopal School; District Education Commissioner, California State Assembly
- Written Statements:

1. Julie Bruno, President, Academic Senate for California Community Colleges
2. Miriam Goldstein, Legislative Director, Congresswoman Jackie Speier (CA-14)

American Podiatric Medical Association, Council on Podiatric Medical Education (CPME)

Action for Consideration: Renewal of recognition

Committee Recommendation: Vote 13 – 0

Renew the agency's recognition for a period of five years.

Discussion: NACIQI concurred with the staff recommendation.

NACIQI Primary Readers:

Paul J. LeBlanc

Richard F. O'Donnell

Representative of the Agency:

Michael Trepal, DPM | Vice Chair, CPME

Kieran Mahan, DPM | CPME Accreditation Committee

Alan Tinkleman | Director, CPME

Council on Chiropractic Education (CCE)

Action for Consideration: Renewal of recognition

Committee Recommendation: Vote 14 – 0

Continue the agency's current recognition and require the agency to come into compliance within 12 months, and submit a compliance report 30 days after the 12 month period that demonstrates the agency's compliance with the issues identified in the report.

Discussion: NACIQI concurred with the staff recommendation.

NACIQI Primary Readers:

Ralph Wolff

Federico Zaragoza

Representative of the Agency:

Craig S. Little, DC, M.Ed. | President, CCE

Ray Bennett | Vice President of Accreditation and Operations, CCE

Elizabeth Goulard, Ed.D. | Council Chair, CCE

Third Party Commenters:

1. Michael Guinosso, D.C., The Da Vinci Group, Steering Committee, Chair
2. Keith S. Overland, Chiropractic Physician-Past president of the American Chiropractic Association, American Chiropractic Association
3. Dr. Selina Sigafoose-Jackson, International Chiropractors Association (ICA)
4. Dr. David O' Brien

Written Statements:

1. Michael Guinosso, D.C., The Da Vinci Group, Steering Committee, Chair
2. Toby Adam Goncharoff, D.C.
3. Dr. Jack M. Bourla, President, International Federation of Chiropractors and Organizations
4. Steve Tullius, D.C., Movement for Chiropractic Quality and Integrity
5. Arno J. Burnier, D.C. Co-founder of Movement for Chiropractic Quality and Integrity
6. Dr. David Herd, President, American Chiropractic Association
7. Dr. Lucas Matlock, Matlock Chiropractic
8. Bev Foster, D.C., DABCO, American Academy of Chiropractic Physicians

Commission on English Language Program Accreditation (CEA)

Action for Consideration: Renewal of recognition

Committee Recommendation: Vote 15 – 0

Continue the agency's current recognition and require the agency to come into compliance within 12 months, and submit a compliance report 30 days after the 12 month period.

Discussion: NACIQI concurred with the staff recommendation.

NACIQI Primary Readers:

Susan D. Phillips

Arthur J. Rothkopf

Representative of the Agency:

Mary Reeves, Ph.D. | Executive Director, CEA

Heidi Vallenga, Ph.D. | Associate Director, CEA

Engin Ayvaz | Commission Chair, CEA

Joint Review Committee on Education in Radiologic Technology (JRCERT)

Action for Consideration: Renewal of recognition

Committee Recommendation: Vote 15 – 0

Renew the agency’s recognition for a period of five years.

Discussion: NACIQI concurred with the staff recommendation.

NACIQI Primary Readers:

Jill Derby

Anne Neal

Representative of the Agency:

Leslie F. Winter, MS, RT (R) | CEO, JRCERT

Laura S. Aaron, Ph.D., RT, (R)(M)(QM), FASRT | Board Chair, JRCERT

Tricia D. Leggett, D.H.Ed., RT, (R)(QM) | Board Second Vice Chair, JRCERT

NATIONAL COORDINATING CENTER ACCREDITATION WORKGROUP

Meg Grigal, Co-Director of Think College, presented on inclusive higher education and model demonstration programs for students with intellectual disabilities. Stephanie Smith Lee, Chair of the National Coordinating Center Accreditation Workgroup, presented the Workgroup’s report on model accreditation standards for higher education programs for students with intellectual disability. Chairman Keiser appointed Member Derlin to represent NACIQI on the Accreditation Workgroup going forward. Member Derlin enthusiastically accepted the appointment.

Presentation materials are accessible on the [NACIQI website](#) under “February 22-24, 2017 Meeting.”

NACIQI POLICY DISCUSSION

NACIQI engaged in a policy discussion regarding lessons learned from the pilot project, and discussed implementation of the pilot as a standard, on-going practice of NACIQI’s review of accrediting agencies. The majority of members were in favor of continuing this practice.

Oliver Schak from the Office of Planning, Evaluation, and Policy Development, presented the update of the accreditation dashboards to NACIQI. Presentation materials are accessible on the [NACIQI website](#) under “February 22-24, 2017 Meeting.”

In addition to reaching consensus to continue use of the accreditor dashboards in NACIQI’s review of accrediting agencies, and to identify new opportunities or measures to incorporate into the dashboards, NACIQI passed the following motions as part of its policy discussion:

Extend a formal invitation to the Secretary or her designee to address the Committee at the next NACIQI meeting. Vote 15-0

NACIQI will continue to use the pilot project questions in its review of accrediting agencies. Vote 11-3

NACIQI will continue use of the consent agenda as it did during the pilot project. Vote 14-0

Invite a representative to speak about the accreditor dashboards to every meeting. Vote 9-0