

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

K-12 SUBCOMMITTEE BREAKOUT DISCUSSION

PRESIDENT'S ADVISORY COMMISSION ON
EDUCATIONAL EXCELLENCE FOR HISPANICS

Fall 2014 Public Meeting

Wednesday, September 3, 2014

2:15 p.m.

The University of Texas at San Antonio

Downtown Campus

501 W. Cesar Chavez Boulevard

San Antonio, Texas 78207, at 2:15 p.m.

Reported by: Natalie Hunsucker, CSR

Hoffman Reporting & Video Service

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

A-P-P-E-A-R-A-N-C-E-S

PATRICIA GANDARA

JOANN GAMA

LILY ESKELSEN GARCIA

MONICA MARTINEZ

VERONICA MELVIN

KENT SCRIBNER

MARIA NEIRA

JOANN GAMA

MARCO DAVIS

1 K-12 SUBCOMMITTEE BREAKOUT DISCUSSION

2 MS. GANDARA: All right. So what we have
3 done in this committee in the past and, unless I'm told
4 not to, I think is a good idea is to include all of you in
5 the discussion just as the committee members because you
6 have important ideas, thoughts, comments, and we don't get
7 another opportunity to really share. So it just makes it
8 doubly difficult when we have only 30 minutes, but I still
9 want to encourage you to comment.

10 I have to ask first, because we have an
11 agenda here that is at least good for 75 minutes or so,
12 what your preference would be in terms of which issues to
13 take up first. Under old business, we have the issue of
14 the immigrant student services and comments on that. We
15 have the discussion, which Marco and I had talked about at
16 some length actually having today, about how we should
17 proceed with the teacher recognition piece. I think we
18 have to touch on that for five minutes anyway because some
19 decisions have to be made.

20 We have the issue of whether this committee
21 wants to be engaged in developing one or more policy
22 documents having to do with teacher recruitment and
23 perhaps other issues. We have -- And under there, I have
24 particularly the disappearance of Title 7 funding, which
25 we once had and I believe should have again, and the issue

1 of dissemination of the work because there's actually a
2 lot of stuff that is happening, going on, getting done,
3 being documented, being published. And I have great
4 concerns about how well we're disseminating all of that.

5 But under new business are also the issues
6 of unaccompanied child migrants, comments on a policy
7 consideration for dreamers who want to be prepare to
8 become teachers and whether the committee is still
9 interested in the two (inaudible) sides that it now has or
10 does it want to shift. And those two (inaudible) sides
11 being the immigrant student services and the teacher
12 recruitment. Or does the committee want to shift
13 priorities or add other priorities and I know there's some
14 comment here about that.

15 Alejandra is supposed to join us sometime
16 during these 30 minutes to talk about the 25th anniversary
17 and what we would like our role to be in that and what
18 kinds of initiatives we would like to push. And, finally, I
19 wanted to put on the table perhaps a closer conversation
20 with AFT and CTA, who are representative of our committee
21 but have not had, I think, as high of a profile on this
22 committee as they deserve and could help us with
23 representing, I mean, given that we have this whole focus
24 on teacher recruitment.

25 So those are the issues. Do I hear anything

1 from the committee about where you would want to start on
2 that list? We're not going to make it through all of
3 this.

4 MS. MELVIN: We might want to just break up,
5 I don't know, in terms of time, into the two subgroups
6 that we have and have our own subgroups.

7 MS. GANDARA: ISS and the teacher stuff?

8 MS. MELVIN: Yeah.

9 MR. DAVIS: So because it's a public meeting
10 and we have to transcribe it, that would be hard to do.

11 MS. MELVIN: No subgroup. No subgroups of
12 the subgroups.

13 MS. SPEAKER: (Inaudible.)

14 MR. DAVIS: That would be hard to --

15 MS. GANDARA: All right. While you consider
16 that, I think I'm going to push it over to Marco and I to
17 have a little bit of a conversation with you guys about
18 the -- the teacher recognition/recruitment and the three
19 basic options we have before us about how we would like to
20 pursue that.

21 Marco, you want to outline the -- the three?

22 MR. DAVIS: Yes. Perfect. So you all may
23 recall, but for the certain -- for our -- for our guests,
24 let me share that two years ago, in 2012, the subcommittee
25 undertook a teacher recognition program whereby it sought

1 to recognize and elevate outstanding educators in the
2 Latino community. Ultimately, the program -- the teacher
3 recognition program was made a White House Champions of
4 Change program, which is a program that the White House
5 manages fairly regularly. It's available at
6 whitehouse.gov/champions. You can see where fairly
7 regularly, almost on a weekly basis, the White House
8 features outstanding, what they call, sort of everyday
9 heros, people who are not household names but who should
10 be, but who are not necessarily nationally recognized, who
11 are doing great work in various areas, whether it be
12 education, (inaudible), employment, law, et cetera,
13 et cetera, et cetera, et cetera. So they have a standard
14 process and focus.

15 So that was one program that was done. And
16 so now the question before the subcommittee or -- or
17 for -- for the sake of time is to think about sort of how
18 to do this teacher recognition program, again, as there's
19 been a desire to -- to repeat it. But there are
20 essentially sort of three options to pursue it as I've
21 outlined it. But there's probably more than three, but
22 certainly three that have been discussed thus far.

23 So I want us to -- to repeat this Champions
24 of Change program. But what I would remind folks sort of
25 the way I -- to outline it, sort of the main features of

1 that is to poll the Champions of Change event. What would
2 happen would be that the -- the commissioners would find
3 some way, through outreach, et cetera, to identify a slate
4 of teachers and to submit recommendations to the White
5 House for review. The White House would then review those
6 recommendations, review that slate of potential
7 candidates, would vet them, which is one of the standard
8 pieces that the White House does, which is sort of a
9 minimal background check to make sure that they're not
10 felons and so on partly because they're -- they're
11 recognized at the White House, so they have to attend the
12 ceremony, as well, and also apply any additional criteria
13 that the White House deems necessary in order to make
14 their selections. So that's a process that they manage
15 internally at the White House.

16 So, obviously, one of the advantages of
17 repeating the Champions of Change program is that the
18 program would then be held at the White House. Teachers
19 would be featured on the White House Champions of Change
20 website. There would be a media advisory issued by the
21 White House Communications Office, et cetera. Also, an
22 advantage would be leveraging the -- the White House
23 infrastructure. So holding an event at the White House
24 South Court Auditorium, those press releases and -- and
25 bios are drafted by the White House, et cetera. And, of

1 course, the teacher could go to Washington and see that
2 it's the White House's part of the program.

3 Obviously, the challenges to repeating that
4 program, as experienced prior, was that there's a loss of
5 autonomy. So the White House has the final say on the
6 criteria and the final say on the final slate of the
7 teachers, on the final selections. What the commission
8 would be able to do is to make a recommendation of those
9 seven people, but the White House ultimately would make
10 that decision as they run that program.

11 There are also sometimes challenges in terms
12 of costs associated, most notably travel for the honored
13 teachers to the White House, as the White House does not
14 have a budget for any of the Champions of Change programs.
15 So the teachers who are selected to be honored have to
16 under -- underwrite their own costs. It also --

17 MS. GANDARA: Or somebody on the committee
18 has to come up with the money for it.

19 MR. DAVIS: Right. But, see, if someone on
20 the committee comes up with it, much like Option B, as
21 I'll talk about in a minute, then it's a process that the
22 commission has to take on anyway separate from the White
23 House and it's still subject to -- so only doing it for
24 the ones that are selected by the White House, et cetera.

25 MS. GANDARA: All right. So before you go

1 on to the two, are -- are you finished with one?

2 MR. DAVIS: Yeah. The only other thing I
3 was going to say is, also, just bear in mind that
4 obviously, then, it also would be subject to the White
5 House timetable. For example, when this Champions of
6 Change ceremony could be held is subject to the White
7 House.

8 MS. GANDARA: And the obvious thing to
9 consider here, as we discussed in a private -- in a
10 previous meeting, was that it -- not only do we lose
11 autonomy, we lose continuity of a certain sense because it
12 doesn't have its own life. It just becomes something that
13 is part of Champions of Change. And in a change of
14 administrations --

15 MR. DAVIS: Right.

16 MS. GANDARA: -- we would not necessarily
17 have an ongoing program.

18 MR. DAVIS: Right.

19 MS. GARCIA: Do the -- Does the committee
20 get to know what the White House criteria is?

21 MR. DAVIS: Yes.

22 MS. GARCIA: That would be helpful. Because
23 I think before, we were selecting people that met our
24 criteria and then there were additional, obviously, things
25 that were going on that we -- if we had know it in

1 advance, we would have maybe made other selections.

2 MR. DAVIS: Yes. Good point. Okay. So --
3 so that -- So that's option one just to think about.

4 Option two (inaudible), very simply, will be
5 for the commission to (inaudible). The process would be
6 that commissioners would develop a set of criteria, would
7 conduct outreach, recruiting candidates, oversee the
8 selection process and create the actual recognition
9 program event at the (inaudible) et cetera, et cetera, et
10 cetera. Obviously, one advantage is that there is then
11 the full commission autonomy. There's full commission
12 branding, visibility for the commission. For that, there
13 is that potential for continuity at the minimum through
14 this commission. And should this commission be recharged
15 in the future administration, it could continue that
16 program.

17 Some of the challenges are that there is no
18 existing infrastructure before that. Right? So the
19 criteria don't exist. Because even if you revisited last
20 year's, you would have to -- to take a look at that again.
21 All planning and implementation would have to be carried
22 out either by the commissions for (inaudible) resources
23 any funds to the underwriting costs of the program would
24 have to be raised by the commission, et cetera.
25 Obviously, the (inaudible) all the support that goes

1 through its own processing department (inaudible) for any
2 gifts, solicitation and/or receipt to the Department of
3 Education and sort of putting out all sort of visibility
4 in media and outreach, et cetera. That's two.

5 Three is a -- a new possibility based on a
6 conversation we had about a month ago with an organization
7 called Hispanic Heritage Foundation. And for those who
8 are not familiar, I will very briefly just mention it.
9 The Hispanic Heritage Foundation was established by the
10 White House in 1987 but is now an independent 503(C)
11 nonprofit organization. But it was originally established
12 to commemorate the creation of the Hispanic Heritage month
13 in America.

14 It was known best for its prestigious
15 Hispanic Heritage Awards, which they still hold each year,
16 and are considered among the highest honors for Hispanics
17 in the U.S., often recognizing Latino leaders who have
18 made positive contributions in the U.S., in Latin-America
19 and globally in various categories. It honors physicians,
20 scientists, educators, public officials, celebrities,
21 athletes, et cetera. There's an annual event attended by
22 many people in Washington, D.C. Certainly the Warner
23 Theater has been attended by many sort of dignitaries.

24 The Hispanic Heritage Foundation also,
25 several years back, 16 years ago, added a youth awards

1 program where high school students have been selected for
2 their achievements in the classroom, in the community and
3 in focus of ten priority tracks, one of which is
4 education. After a high profile search featuring outreach
5 to 4,000 schools, young people are selected in regions
6 through a -- a local committee that will pass on the word
7 to local educators, staff and board members for the
8 Hispanic Heritage Foundation. And then there's three
9 regional winners and then there's five national winners
10 for young people.

11 The reason why I bring it up the youth
12 awards is that the youth winners -- each of these three
13 regional youth winners is asked to nominate the teacher
14 who has made a significant impact on them, on their
15 success per the innovative teacher recognition program.
16 So in each of the eleven markets, one teacher is selected.
17 Basically, the young people identify the teacher. They're
18 asked to get contact info and a bio and so on. But they
19 also are asked to write an essay on behalf -- or from
20 their perspective on the teacher, which includes things
21 like their vision, their empathy, their mentoring, their
22 guidance, their innovative ideas and untraditional efforts
23 to reach the students, cultural connectivity, engaging
24 with parents, et cetera, et cetera, et cetera.

25 The Hispanic Heritage Foundation, again,

1 uses a local selection committee to review those
2 applications and staff that have been very (inaudible) to
3 (inaudible) at the moment, make the selection of those
4 individual teachers as soon as they know the winners so
5 that they can select from each market. From those eleven,
6 one is selected as the national winner who would attend
7 the national Hispanic Heritage Youth Awards program. All
8 of these are usually broadcast on television as well as
9 other things.

10 So what the Hispanic Heritage Foundation has
11 expressed interest in is in collaborating with the
12 initiative or the commission in looking at combining --
13 combining or involving the commission in some way in that
14 innovative teacher program. So the idea is that what
15 would happen here. And, obviously, there's still many
16 more conversations that need to be held, what we're
17 exploring through a few other activities, as well, in
18 creating a formal partnership with the Hispanic Heritage
19 Foundation and having an actual (inaudible) agreement
20 signed off on by the Department of Education and the
21 Hispanic Heritage Foundation for a number of activities,
22 one which would include this. It doesn't have to be
23 this -- this (inaudible).

24 Advantages would be leveraging the external
25 organization and infrastructure and their process for

1 identifying and selecting teachers. There's obviously
2 eleven regional markets throughout the country, so there's
3 a potential to build into that. There's also an
4 opportunity there in that some if -- some if not all the
5 of costs could be borne by the Hispanic Heritage
6 Foundation. So basically as part of this (inaudible),
7 they're then able to fundraise, to get sponsors and so on
8 independent of us not to have the need to go through the
9 Department of Education's review process for fundraising
10 so long as they make their -- their fundraising their
11 portion of the event, which would include things like
12 travel. At the moment, the Innovative Teacher (inaudible)
13 all their expenses are paid for travel, so (inaudible).

14 Obviously, the challenge is there. There is
15 also a different type of loss of autonomy and that's
16 partnering with a partner and having to negotiate some of
17 those pieces, obviously, the same piece of visibility,
18 making sure that the two entities are well represented and
19 visible and so on and so forth (inaudible) White House
20 program as compared to the Championship program
21 (inaudible). So those are sort of just the three options
22 to put on the table to consider as -- as the commission
23 thinks about what direction you want to go.

24 MS. GANDARA: It's not clear to me how the
25 commission doesn't disappear into the Hispanic Heritage.

1 And wouldn't there ultimately be only one teacher?

2 MR. DAVIS: So yeah. So we weren't able to
3 go sort of more in depth in terms of that. And I didn't
4 want, also, to go to too, too much into detail with them.
5 What I can say is that I think that the Hispanic Heritage
6 Foundation is fairly flexible, fairly adaptable in
7 (inaudible) the program.

8 So I think things like the question of
9 expanding it to be more than one national winner, figuring
10 out how to co-brand, so, for example, it could be the --
11 for -- for brevity's sake, the Commission/Hispanic
12 Heritage Foundation outstanding teacher award. I mean, I
13 think they could -- they would even consider renaming it
14 that way. There would be the ability to do all the media
15 (inaudible) with the commission's partner (inaudible)
16 Hispanic Heritage Foundation. And the commission is
17 honoring these folks.

18 There could be (inaudible) for the
19 commission to invite them to Washington, D.C., or
20 something to figure out ways to recognize, honor and
21 support them, raise their visibility and raise the
22 (inaudible) to their participation in the program. We
23 could have commissioners. Well, they did, in fact,
24 suggest, for example, the (inaudible) was we could work to
25 have a commissioner and/or staff person represented in

1 each of the regional markets being the ones presenting the
2 award to the teacher, so (inaudible) the actual ceremony
3 where the youth awards happen and the teacher is
4 recognized (inaudible) be incorporated into the program
5 and visible recognizable (inaudible).

6 There's -- There is some flexibility.
7 There's not a lot of definitive. But it's something that,
8 again, if you wanted to pursue that avenue (inaudible)
9 right now, you could have further conversation about how
10 that would work to see if it would meet your requirements.

11 MS. GANDARA: Just before I ask Lily to
12 comment, do you know what their cycle is like right now?

13 MS. GARCIA: (Inaudible.)

14 MS. GANDARA: Oh, thank you. Great minds,
15 huh? Okay.

16 MR. DAVIS: Okay. So their current --

17 MS. GANDARA: So that means it wouldn't be
18 until the following September at the earliest?

19 MR. DAVIS: So -- Not exactly. So the
20 application, I think, deadline is September 30th, right?

21 MS. MARTINEZ: Yes.

22 MR. DAVIS: Yeah. So the application for
23 the youth award is September 30th, which means they'll
24 receive the youth applications. The youth are the ones
25 who nominate teachers. So it's actually spring, I think,

1 into the summer where they recognize the teachers. So you
2 could conceivably jump into this cycle if you desire.

3 MS. GARCIA: Because I know Tony Tijerina so
4 well, my comfort level is high. If this was like an --
5 an --

6 MR. DAVIS: Unknown area.

7 MS. GARCIA: -- unknown, right, I -- I'd
8 probably go whoa, whoa, whoa. So there's two things.
9 I -- I like the organization itself. It's a small
10 organization. It's not a very political organization. It
11 really deals with cultural -- preserving Hispanic culture.
12 So that appeals to me.

13 And the other thing is -- and I don't know
14 how to say this in a nice way -- commissions like ours
15 disappear every day. So we can't -- You know, we'll do
16 great work and I think we'll make an impact. But I never
17 thought of this commission as going on in 20 years,
18 because the next president of whatever party will have
19 different priorities. It might not be education of --
20 Hispanic excellence in education. It might be Hispanic
21 excellence in entrepreneurs and small businesses. I mean,
22 they -- there'll be a different focus inevitably.

23 So I -- I want to -- I look at us as the
24 clock is ticking and how do we take something that -- that
25 we all thought was a really good idea in recruiting more

1 Latino teachers as the population and the student
2 population grows, how are we going to have the faculty in
3 a school reflect the community. And this was one tiny
4 little piece of, you know, making it a little glamorous,
5 to say, "You're recognized. You did an amazing thing."
6 They went to the White House. It got some -- It got some
7 media coverage. When we're gone, how will that continue
8 on?

9 And so, you know, I was thinking when you
10 got to number two, the second thing, I thought, well,
11 maybe AFT and NEA could take this over and make it more
12 the teachers. And we're hopefully not going away real
13 soon. That's my -- That's my goal. But if you have
14 something like the Hispanic Heritage Foundation, it kind
15 of takes it out of that political realm where maybe our
16 organizations have a good or bad relationship with the
17 administration and future administrations. You're never
18 going to have that with the foundation.

19 I like the idea of saying the connection we
20 have is that we would be part of the selection committee.
21 We could work with -- We could work with the foundation on
22 what the criteria would be. And we wouldn't -- we won't
23 forever maybe have this commission as the -- as the brand
24 of it, but that's less important to me than the
25 recognition that we wanted to have.

1 And this is (inaudible). Okay. And this is
2 very popular on all the Spanish language television shows
3 around the country and -- and in certain places in -- in
4 Mexico. So I -- That appeals to me. And without knowing
5 a lot more of the details, I -- I could live with that.

6 MR. SCRIBNER: Another -- Another, for me,
7 encouraging sign is looking at who they're going to be
8 honoring this year. One of the -- the education honorees
9 are the Carl Hayden High School robotics team from -- from
10 our school district.

11 (Simultaneous discussion)

12 MR. SCRIBNER: The -- the -- The
13 documentary, "Underwater Dreams" --

14 MS. SPEAKER: Oh, that's at your school?

15 MR. SCRIBNER: That's our school.

16 MS. SPEAKER: I wondered about that.

17 MR. SCRIBNER: And then the featured film
18 with George Lopez and Marisa Tomei and -- and -- and
19 others, in January, "Spare Parts," is coming out. And --
20 and -- And I just say that because earlier this morning, a
21 couple of speakers, they talked about the activism and
22 dreamers and young people. And here is a wonderful
23 example of students who are excelling in stem and -- and
24 beating MIT in these competitions. They are the ones in
25 Arizona, my kids, who are leading the -- the group for

1 grassroots efforts towards (inaudible) immigration reform.
2 So I'm all for it.

3 MS. NEIRA: I'd like to follow up on a
4 couple of things. One, I think it's going to be important
5 for the commission to have an understanding of what goes
6 into the MOU Commission. I think that's a real critical
7 piece. I think the co-branding, even if it's just
8 temporary, is critical to keep that role going.

9 I particularly appreciate the new voice,
10 that it really takes it away from the political voice also
11 locally when it comes from the students. We always say --
12 Teachers always say that if you want to be evaluated, go
13 to your students. So I think it's a real great way of
14 recognizing the voice of the students and sometimes
15 parents because the parents are so involved in that
16 process. So I -- I really support this with the caveat
17 that it really is a partnership.

18 And I think, as Lily said, the smallness of
19 the group and their intensity on culture, it -- it just
20 lends itself to collaboration. So I think I'm a lot more
21 comfortable with that than with the first recommendation
22 because it does take it away from the process.

23 That being said, I -- I want to go back to
24 the statement I made this morning. This is just a small
25 part of the process that we talked about. I think,

1 Patricia, you said about the new business and the new
2 business is really trying to build upon what -- this whole
3 recruitment piece, because the recognition is just a
4 celebration, a celebration of the profession. It really
5 doesn't go to the heart of recruiting the -- the pipeline
6 that we need in our classrooms at this point.

7 MS. GANDARA: Does it -- Marco, does it tend
8 to lean towards high school teachers who get chosen
9 because it -- okay -- yeah, because these are the students
10 who --

11 MS. GARCIA: That should be part of the
12 criteria of looking to say that we have a number of early
13 childhood and elementary and secondary teachers. And it
14 doesn't come up from the students because they're not
15 going to have second graders (inaudible), but that there's
16 some way of recognizing (inaudible).

17 MS. GANDARA: Okay. If there's any other
18 comment about this?

19 MS. SPEAKER: I'd like to comment. I think
20 that the option to have the students recognize their
21 teacher is the best one. We give awards to teachers and
22 they stay on the shelf and they're great for that time
23 when you take a trip. But if you want to leave a legacy
24 and really have their -- their story told, it's through
25 the eyes of the child. Teachers love that.

1 We -- You know, I have a student that I've
2 been in touch with after 26 years. He's my legacy. He's
3 my -- He's the reason that I do what I do. So I think
4 having students tell their story and letting that live on
5 will be a much bigger award than anything else.

6 MR. SPEAKER: I have a question on the
7 Heritage -- Hispanic Heritage. The criteria, we're
8 talking about recruitment, right, for Hispanic
9 recruitment? I'm a student. The person that influenced
10 me was Mr. Smith. Am I going to be eliminated because I
11 picked Mr. Smith and not Mr. Martinez? You see what I
12 mean?

13 So we're trying to recruit that -- So, in
14 other words, I'm a kid that's gotten nominated because I
15 was a great Hispanic kid in class, but my teacher that
16 influenced me was Mr. Smith. Well, is that part of our
17 criteria is going to be that it has to be Hispanic or not
18 Hispanic? Because then I'm getting nominated and I'm
19 going to write things about Mr. Smith and how great he
20 was. But with that rule, the committee's there saying,
21 "Well, I guess, Smith. We don't want Smith. We want
22 Martinez." So does that mean -- Are we going to have that
23 standard?

24 (Simultaneous discussion)

25 MS. GANDARA: I -- I appreciate you bringing

1 that up. What we had decided in the last round was that
2 we were looking for Latino teachers or -- or teachers who
3 had dedicated themselves to the Latino population. And we
4 actually did have --

5 MS. SPEAKER: We had non-Latino teachers.

6 MS. GANDARA: We had a couple of non-Latino
7 teachers.

8 MR. SPEAKER: But as a -- but as a
9 student -- Yeah, well, that's what I was going to say.

10 MR. SCRIBNER: Yeah.

11 MR. SPEAKER: Because as a student, how
12 would --

13 MR. SCRIBNER: Right.

14 MR. SPEAKER: -- they wouldn't know. You
15 know what I'm saying?

16 MR. SCRIBNER: Right. The -- The robotics
17 experience, Freddie Lajvardi from -- immigrated from Iran
18 and has been in -- in West Phoenix his entire career
19 connecting with kids.

20 MR. SPEAKER: I just wanted to make sure.

21 MR. SCRIBNER: Yeah.

22 MS. GANDARA: Well, it's absolutely an
23 excellent question, as it would need to be revisited now too.

24 (Simultaneous discussion)

25 MS. MELVIN: Related to that, are we still

1 holding these teachers to our standards or the White House
2 standards or is that out the door now?

3 (Simultaneous discussion)

4 MS. SPEAKER: We would need to continue to
5 develop our -- our standards, our criteria.

6 MR. DAVIS: Right. So this -- so we --
7 There would be more flexibility. It would not sort of
8 be -- Because it would not be part of the Champions
9 program, there would not be that specific set of criteria.
10 But that's part of the pieces to which Maria was alluding,
11 that that would be the negotiation with the foundation
12 about what the criteria would be. And I know that the
13 commission would be able to sort of forward some ideas.

14 If they wanted something more concrete,
15 then, you know, at the -- at the moment, I'm not sure.
16 I'd need to get some more information on that. I'd have
17 to do some follow-up. It seems to be a little bit more
18 based on sort of the inspiration and the student's
19 impression of the teachers, effectiveness, impact,
20 motivation, you know, things like connections to the
21 parents. Right. Is it just that that teacher was
22 connected to the student's parents or is it all the
23 teachers' parents? Those are pieces that could be
24 explored that we could figure out ways to define it, to
25 capture more.

1 MR. ARTILES: So I -- I agree with the
2 arguments made in terms of the (inaudible) the foundation
3 (inaudible) so far and particularly the issue of
4 sustainability and how do we keep this up over time. The
5 other concern I have is impact. Okay. We recognize these
6 individuals who have exemplary careers. Beyond this
7 legacy (inaudible) also these individual stories can
8 contribute to a -- a knowledge base, which is (inaudible)
9 base in terms of what we do to learn this in the larger
10 scheme of things.

11 So I think we should think about raising
12 money to document this individual's trajectory (inaudible)
13 in which we can carefully disseminate not only through the
14 commission's networks but all the networks that all of us
15 have in our respective professional careers and make sure
16 that this really is used in meaningful ways, not only
17 teacher education programs, but also professional
18 development, so really go beyond the recognition of that
19 individual and ask the question: "What we can we learn
20 from this person's experiences given the evidence we have
21 before us? What are the lessons that (inaudible) that we
22 can build over time?"

23 MS. SPEAKER: This person being what did we
24 learn from the teachers or what are we learning from the
25 student and how they view the teachers?

1 MR. ARTILES: It's stories that we gather
2 about these teachers, whether it's the students' stories
3 or the students' or the teachers' experience, but how do
4 we impact the profession, as an example, from the lessons
5 we derive reflecting on what we have learned (inaudible).

6 MS. GARCIA: Can I piggyback on that?
7 Because -- and it's -- it's -- it triggered where this
8 recognition/recruitment that we're talking about, what
9 you're talking about is how do we use these award winning
10 incredible teachers to build something that then recruits
11 other wonderful, credible people.

12 MR. ARTILES: Exactly.

13 MS. GARCIA: And I -- I -- I don't want to
14 make the -- the judgment that because you're a Latino
15 student, you live in a poor neighborhood. But we know
16 that a lot of high minority populations are high poverty
17 populations. Part of the recruitment that -- that I
18 wanted to, you know, add to that is what drew those --
19 assuming or -- or analyzing which of those award winners
20 are in challenged neighborhoods, poverty neighborhoods,
21 what drew them to that? Because we're -- we're looking
22 for ways of getting incredibly bright, talented career
23 people who will teach in the most challenging way.

24 MS. GANDARA: Can I please second that?
25 Because that was my -- I think this was what made me

1 rather upset the last time around was because that was
2 knocked out. The teachers who came from these kinds of
3 neighborhoods were not in the running, basically, because
4 the schools weren't doing that well --

5 MS. GARCIA: All based on test scores.

6 MS. GANDARA: -- based on test scores. And
7 so, for me, this would be very important that we talk
8 about people who are doing this work in the hard places
9 and not in the easy places.

10 MS. GARCIA: And -- And why they wanted to
11 teach there and why they wanted to stay there, I think, is
12 what the analysis should be based on.

13 MS. GANDARA: Well, it sounds like this
14 Heritage Foundation has a lot of positives and probably
15 more positives than the other two options. Though it does
16 also seem to me like this being September 3rd and then
17 closing September 30th and having to come up with criteria
18 and ideas about how we would do this and what the MOU is
19 and everything else simply may not be possible on this
20 cycle --

21 MR. DAVIS: It may or may not.

22 MS. GANDARA: -- realistically.

23 MR. DAVIS: It may.

24 MS. GANDARA: It may or it may not.

25 MR. DAVIS: It's not definitely out of the

1 question.

2 MS. MELVIN: We close deals like this in a
3 month.

4 MR. DAVIS: Well, and, also, again, I
5 think --

6 (Simultaneous discussion)

7 MR. DAVIS: -- I think the teacher portion
8 doesn't close.

9 MS. GANDARA: But the students --

10 MR. DAVIS: Right. And so then the students
11 who, as I understood the process --

12 MS. SPEAKER: They would need some direction
13 also.

14 MR. DAVIS: -- the students who are
15 selected -- Right. And so I think it's after September
16 30th when the students are selected or asked to nominate a
17 teacher, after that.

18 MS. GARCIA: Okay. And we can -- we can
19 impact the criteria after that on -- on looking at the
20 teachers.

21 MS. GANDARA: On the teachers.

22 (Simultaneous discussion)

23 MS. GANDARA: But the students have to be
24 given some direction, though, right, about who you're
25 choosing? Like consider also elementary schoolteachers --

1 MR. DAVIS: Right.

2 MS. MARTINEZ: -- and that sort of thing?

3 MR. DAVIS: Right. But they -- Again, I
4 don't think they submit the nomination with their
5 application. I think they submit it later.

6 MS. GANDARA: Oh.

7 MR. DAVIS: Yeah.

8 MS. SPEAKER: So right now, it's just the
9 students that get submitted?

10 MR. DAVIS: They just submit to -- Because
11 they -- The youth award wins a scholarship and
12 recognition.

13 MS. GANDARA: And then they --

14 MR. DAVIS: They -- Then the winners
15 nominate a teacher.

16 MR. SPEAKER: They select winners per
17 region.

18 MR. DAVIS: Right.

19 (Simultaneous discussion)

20 MR. SPEAKER: Every region has to send the
21 students who win.

22 MR. DAVIS: Right.

23 MR. SPEAKER: Then from that region, they'll
24 send a teacher. Then all those who will be considered for
25 the national program, they select one in each category.

1 MS. GANDARA: But we're talking about trying
2 to broaden that so it's (inaudible).

3 MR. SPEAKER: Right.

4 MS. SPEAKER: And -- And my question was
5 about the fairness of being able to nominate a teacher.
6 How -- how -- How does it happen? Do you get buy-in from
7 the school districts or how -- how do the kids get to know
8 that this is open for them?

9 MR. DAVIS: Yeah. So the -- so the -- Any
10 student, I believe, of Hispanic descent anywhere in
11 America can sub -- Well, actually, I don't know if it's
12 anywhere in America or just the eleven markets. But
13 they're able to submit an application.

14 MS. SPEAKER: So where is the information
15 found for them to be included in that?

16 (Simultaneous discussion)

17 MR. DAVIS: It's on their website. It's --
18 It's this outreach to 4,000 schools through nonprofit
19 organizations that they partner with. So they disseminate
20 it through social media. They disseminate news about the
21 application.

22 (Simultaneous discussion)

23 MS. SPEAKER: So we wouldn't know
24 specifically what school districts have presented the
25 information or anything like that?

1 MR. DAVIS: So they might be able to know
2 that. I don't know that they know your -- I -- I know
3 what -- Well, I don't know off the top of my head. But
4 the eleven cities, I think they try to get as much input
5 as they can from the eleven cities. They try to spread
6 the word as widely as they can in those eleven regions.

7 MR. SPEAKER: And they've also brought in
8 the (inaudible) through Mundos.

9 MR. DAVIS: Right.

10 MR. SPEAKER: They do Subway in (inaudible).
11 So it really is quite disseminated.

12 (Simultaneous discussion)

13 MR. DAVIS: They try to get -- I mean, they
14 get literally (inaudible) like -- I couldn't even
15 remember. I think it's something like 50,000 applicants.
16 They get a lot.

17 MS. GARCIA: I'm -- I'm assuming that if
18 this commission wanted to partner with them, they'd be
19 thrilled that we could then extend that reach. They're --
20 They're using what their staff and their, you know,
21 ground -- ground troops have. And those of us that are in
22 other areas like -- like our organizations could then say
23 we can push that out. We have affiliates in every state
24 and, between the two of us, in practically every school
25 district. So we could send information out to our

1 affiliates. We don't send information to kids, but we
2 send it to their teachers to make sure the kids in your
3 area have this information.

4 MS. GANDARA: Unless I hear something
5 negative here -- I'm just hyperconscious of the time
6 here -- it sounds to me like folks really very much would
7 like this idea of at least moving forward and getting
8 (inaudible).

9 (Simultaneous conversation)

10 MR. DAVIS: So what I would suggest simply
11 is for the next steps is I can -- I -- we can go back and
12 engage with the Hispanic Heritage Foundation. We can pull
13 in the cochairs for the initial conversation. And then we
14 can look at scheduling (inaudible) e-mails. We can
15 schedule like conference calls among the full subcommittee
16 so that folks are able to review before our final and
17 probably wait and make some sort of final decision once
18 all questions have been answered and there's a clear path
19 (inaudible).

20 MS. GANDARA: And -- And can we just leave
21 it that we will indeed have a conference call with the
22 subcommittee? I'm uncomfortable with the extent at which
23 we haven't had these and haven't had, you know -- And
24 maybe we can actually continue with some of the rest of
25 the agenda as well. Okay. Yes?

1 MS. SPEAKER: A final comment. This is
2 important work. I'm -- I'm pleased to have been here
3 today. I have to get back to my school district for a
4 meeting. But I don't know how I got to be here. I'm
5 happy I'm here. But how does your important work get to
6 us?

7 (Simultaneous discussion)

8 MR. DAVIS: Did you register?

9 MS. SPEAKER: Yes, we did.

10 MR. DAVIS: You will be added to our mailing
11 list. You will get any and all communications from now
12 forward.

13 MS. SPEAKER: Out of curiosity, can you guys
14 tell us who you are?

15 MR. MARTINEZ: My name's Rudy Martinez. I
16 represent (inaudible). I'm in the central division,
17 assistant to the director.

18 (Simultaneous discussion)

19 MS. BARRERA: I'm Diana Barrera. I'm the
20 director of (inaudible) in Somerset ISD here in the
21 San Antonio area.

22 MS. MENDOZA: My name is Marie Mendoza. I'm
23 the director of World Languages. I teach bilingual, ESL,
24 language (inaudible) for middle school and high school,
25 Irving Independent School District (inaudible).

1 MS. SPEAKER: Take a look at our book.

2 MS. MENDOZA: I know. I have.

3 MS. SPEAKER: There's -- There's a coupon
4 out there.

5 (Simultaneous discussion)

6 MS. TONYA: Hi. I'm Tonya (inaudible) with
7 Educational (inaudible) Service at the San Antonio office,
8 not the Woodstone office.

9 MS. SPEAKER: I'm (inaudible) for
10 (inaudible) America. I (inaudible) of our (inaudible)
11 teachers throughout the nation. So I'm really interested
12 in getting involved and helping out with that.

13 MS. GANDARA: So, for you, it would be very
14 (inaudible) the dreamers (inaudible) and the teachers.

15 MS. SPEAKER: Yes, unaccompanied minors. I
16 need to know everything (inaudible).

17 MS. GARCIA: Delia Garcia, (inaudible).

18 MS. SPEAKER: I'm (inaudible) Molina, vice
19 president of Texas Aide Teachers Association, middle
20 school teacher, ESL.

21 MR. PEREZ: I'm (inaudible) Perez with the
22 American (inaudible) Teachers (inaudible).

23 MR. DAVIS: Thank you all.

24 MS. SPEAKER: Okay. Thank you.

25 (Breakout concluded at 2:52 p.m.)

1 THE STATE OF TEXAS *

2 COUNTY OF BEXAR *

3

4

5 I, NATALIE HUNSUCKER, a Certified Court Reporter
6 duly commissioned and qualified in and for the County of
7 Bexar, State of Texas, do hereby certify that the forgoing
8 is a true and accurate transcription, taken to the best of
9 my ability, of the K-12 Subcommittee Breakout Discussion
10 at the President's Advisory Commission on Educational
11 Excellence for Hispanics, held at the University of Texas
12 at San Antonio Downtown Campus, 501 W. Cesar Chavez
13 Boulevard, San Antonio, Texas 78207, September 3, 2014,
14 from 2:15 p.m. to 2:51 p.m.

15 IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto set my hand
16 on the 23rd day of September, 2014.

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

NATALIE HUNSUCKER, Texas CSR 4279
Expiration Date: 12/31/2015
Hoffman Reporting Service
Firm Registration No. 93
206 East Locust Street
San Antonio, Texas 78212
Phone: 210.736.3555
Fax: 210.736.6679